IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

STATE OF OKLAHOMA,)
Plaintiff,)
v.) Case No. 4:05-CV-00329-TCK-SAJ
TYSON FOODS, INC., et al.,)
Defendants.)

MOTION FOR EXPEDITED HEARING ON ESI PRODUCTION

COMES NOW, the Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma, ex rel. W.A. Drew Edmondson, in his capacity as Attorney General of the State of Oklahoma, and Oklahoma Secretary of the Environment, C. Miles Tolbert, in his capacity as the Trustee for Natural Resources for the State of Oklahoma under CERCLA, (hereinafter "the State") and respectfully ask for an expedited hearing regarding Electronically Stored Information ("ESI") in order to comply with the Court's Order of May 17, 2007 (Dkt #1150) due to disagreements between the parties regarding the format and type of ESI production.

The State respectfully requests an expedited hearing regarding the Court Ordered ESI production for the following reasons:

- 1. The Parties cannot agree on a format for the production of ESI.¹ The parties have met and conferred on numerous occasions regarding this issue and have exchanged the attached most recent correspondence regarding this issue. See Attached Exhibits 1-3.
- 2. The State is producing ESI in Native File Format in response to the Court's guidance and the Defendants' request to produce data so long as it is readable and accessible See

¹ The State has reached a limited agreement with Cargill and Peterson Defendants regarding the production of their E-Mails, however the method being used by Cargill and Peterson is not in the Native File Format. The proposed method does include searchable text, however, the State has reserved all rights regarding the underlying metadata, and to the extent that other Defendants claim to be producing E-Mails in the same manner the State will not object.

Attached Exhibit 1. The State will be prepared to begin its production on July 2, 2007, including its databases. The State has requested that it receive ESI in Native File Format and the Defendants have refused to do so. See Attached Exhibits 2. Defendants are now objecting to the State's proposed ESI productions notwithstanding the Court's guidance of the use of Native File Format. See Transcript of April 27, 2007, Pg. 74-77. See Attached Exhibit 3.

- 3. The State is producing ESI in Native File Format consistent with Fed.R.Civ.P. Rule 34(b)(ii). The State is, however, removing non-responsive E-Mails. In order for the databases the State is producing to be useful and searchable the whole database must be produced. ESI in its Native File Format is easily and quickly searchable. The State will be identifying databases and reports which are responsive to particular requests for production. Because the State is producing ESI as it is kept in the usual course of business and because ESI is easily searchable, Rule 34 is fully complied with. Defendants disagree; specifically Defendants are now demanding the State to categorize its ESI to correspond to a particular request for production in contradiction to the plain language of Rule 34. See Attached Exhibit 4.
- 4 The Defendants are refusing to produce ESI in Native File Format and it is unclear at best whether they intend to categorize their production to correspond to the State's requests. Defendants consistently refuse to provide metadata at this time. Further, the Defendants are refusing to produce databases in a searchable electronic form where they have previously produced reports in hard copy form.
- 5. The State seeks an expedited hearing on June 28, 2007, as the parties agreed deadline to produce ESI is July 2, 2007.
- 6. The State has conferred with the Defendants and they object to the filing of this motion.

Wherefore, the State respectfully moves the Court for an expedited hearing and to enter such Orders as necessary to facilitate a full and useful ESI production.

Respectfully Submitted,

W.A. Drew Edmondson, OBA No. 2628 Attorney General Kelly H. Burch, OBA No. 17067 J. Trevor Hammons, OBA No. 20234 Tina L. Izadi, OBA No. 17978 Assistant Attorneys General State of Oklahoma 313 N.E. 21st Street Oklahoma City, OK 73105 (405) 521-3921

/s/M. David Riggs

M. David Riggs, OBA No. 7583
Joseph P. Lennart, OBA No. 5371
Richard T. Garren, OBA No. 3253
Douglas A. Wilson, OBA No. 13128
Sharon K. Weaver, OBA No. 19010
Robert A. Nance, OBA No. 6581
D. Sharon Gentry, OBA No. 15641
Riggs, Abney, Neal, Turpen
Orbison & Lewis
502 West Sixth Street
Tulsa, OK 74120-2421
(918) 587-3161

James Randall Miler, OBA No. 6214 Louis Werner Bullock, OBA No. 1305 Miller Keffer & Bullock 222 S. Kenosha Tulsa, OK 74120-2421 (918) 743-4460

David P. Page, OBA No. 6852 Bell Legal Group 222 S. Kenosha Tulsa, OK 74120 (918) 398-6800

Frederick C. Baker (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Elizabeth C. Ward (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Elizabeth Claire Xidis (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Lee M. Heath (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Motley Rice, LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465
(843) 216-9280

William H. Narwold (admitted *pro hac vice*) Motley Rice, LLC 20 Church Street, 17th Floor Hartford, CT 06103 (860) 882-1676

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this $\underline{27}^{th}$ day of \underline{June} , 2007 the foregoing document was electronically transmitted to the following:

Frederick C Baker fbaker@motleyrice.com, mcarr@motleyrice.com; fhmorgan@motleyrice.com

Michael R. Bond michael.bond@kutakrock.com, amy.smith@kutakrock.com

Vicki Bronson vbronson@cwlaw.com, lphillips@cwlaw.com

Paula M Buchwald pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com

Louis Werner Bullock | lbullock@mkblaw.net, nhodge@mkblaw.net; bdejong@mkblaw.net

 $W.A.\ Drew\ Edmondson \quad fc_docket@oag.state.ok.us, drew_edmondson@oag.state.ok.us; \\ suzy_thrash@oag.state.ok.us.$

Delmar R Ehrich dehrich@faegre.com, etriplett@faegre.com; qsperrazza@faegre.com

John R Elrod jelrod@cwlaw.com, vmorgan@cwlaw.com

Bruce Wayne Freeman bfreeman@cwlaw.com, lclark@cwlaw.com

D. Richard Funk rfunk@cwlaw.com

Richard T Garren garren@riggsabney.com, dellis@riggsabney.com

Dorothy Sharon Gentry sgentry@riggsabney.com, jzielinski@riggsabney.com

Robert W George robert.george@kutakrock.com, sue.arens@kutakrock.com; amy.smith@kutakrock.com

James Martin Graves jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com

Tgrever@lathropgage.com

Jennifer Stockton Griffin jgriffin@lathropgage.com

John Trevor Hammons thammons@oag.state.ok.us, Trevor_Hammons@oag.state.ok.us; Jean_Burnett@oag.state.ok.us

Lee M Heath lheath@motleyrice.com

Theresa Noble Hill thillcourts@rhodesokla.com, mnave@rhodesokla.com

Philip D Hixon phixon@mcdaniel-lawfirm.com

Mark D Hopson mhopson@sidley.com, joraker@sidley.com

Kelly S Hunter Burch fc.docket@oag.state.ok.us, kelly_burch@oag.state.ok.us; jean_burnett@oag.state.ok.us

Stephen L Jantzen sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com, mantene@ryanwhaley.com; loelke@ryanwhaley.com

Bruce Jones bjones@faegre.com, dybarra@faegre.com; jintermill@faegre.com; cdolan@faegre.com

Jay Thomas Jorgensen jjorgensen@sidley.com

Raymond Thomas Lay rtl@kiralaw.com, dianna@kiralaw.com

Nicole Marie Longwell Nlongwell@@mcdaniel-lawfirm.com

Archer Scott McDaniel smcdaniel@mcdaniel-lawfirm.com

James Randall Miller rmiller@mkblaw.net, smilata@mkblaw.net; clagrone@mkblaw.net

Charles Livingston Moulton Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov, Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov

Robert Allen Nance rnance@riggsabney.com, jzielinski@riggsabney.com

William H Narwold bnarwold@motleyrice.com

George W Owens gwo@owenslawfirmpc.com, ka@owenslawfirmpc.com

David Phillip Page dpage@edbelllaw.com, smilata@edbelllaw.com

Robert Paul Redemann rredemann@pmrlaw.net, scouch@pmrlaw.net

Melvin David Riggs driggs@riggsabney.com, jsummerlin@riggsabney.com

Randall Eugene Rose rer@owenslawfirmpc.com, ka@owenslawfirmpc.com

Robert E Sanders rsanders@youngwilliams.com,

David Charles Senger dsenger@pmrlaw.net, scouch@pmrlaw.net; ntorres@pmrlaw.net

Colin Hampton Tucker chtucker@rhodesokla.com, scottom@rhodesokla.com

John H Tucker jtuckercourts@rhodesokla.com, lwhite@rhodesokla.com

Elizabeth C Ward lward@motleyrice.com

Sharon K Weaver sweaver@riggsabney.com, lpearson@riggsabney.com

Timothy K Webster twebster@sidley.com, jwedeking@sidley.com

Terry Wayen West terry@thewestlawfirm.com,

Edwin Stephen Williams steve.williams@youngwilliams.com

Douglas Allen Wilson Doug_Wilson@riggsabney.com, pmurta@riggsabney.com

jwisley@cwlaw.com, jknight@cwlaw.com

Elizabeth Claire Xidis cxidis@motleyrice.com

Lawrence W Zeringue lzeringue@pmrlaw.net, scouch@pmrlaw.net

I hereby certify that on this 27th day of June, 2007 the foregoing document was mailed via U.S. Postal Service to the following:

Thomas C. Green

Sidley, Austin, Brown & Wood, LLP 1501 K. Street NW Washington, DC 20005

C. Miles Tolbert

Secretary of the Environment State of Oklahoma 3800 North Classen Oklahoma City, OK 73118

Victor E Schwartz Cary Silverman Shook Hardy & Bacon LLP (Washington DC) 600 14th Street NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20005

/s/M. David Riggs

M. David Riggs